



***Title:** *Canada-China Human Capital Dialogue*

Subtitle:

***By:** *Kenny Zhang*

Report Type: *Final Technical Report*

***Date:** *May 30, 2014*

***IDRC Project Number:** 106616-00021199-023

***IDRC Project Title:** *Canada-China Human Capital Dialogue*

***Country/Region:** *Canada and China*

***Full Name of Research Institution:** Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada

***Address of Research Institution:** 220 – 890 West Pender Street, Vancouver, BC, V6C 1J9

***Name(s) and Contact information of Researcher/Members of Research Team:**

APF Canada Researchers:

- Yuen Pau Woo, President and CEO, yuenpau.woo@asiapacific.ca
- Kenny Zhang, Senior Project Manager, Kenny.zhang@asiapacific.ca
- Evelyn Chan, Post-Graduate Research Fellow, evelyn.chan07@gmail.com (January-July 2012)
- Mikhail Iturralde, Researcher, mikhailiturralde@hotmail.com (January 2012-June 2013)
- Eiston Lo, Post-Graduate Research Fellow, Eiston.lo@asiapacific.ca (May 2012-May 2013)
- Kara Shin, Post-Graduate Research Fellow, kara.shin@asiapacific.ca (May 2013-May 2014)

Associate Team:

- Dr. David Zweig, Chair Professor, Division of Social Science, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology, sozweig@ust.hk
- Dr. Qiang Zha, Associate Professor, York University, qzha@edu.yorku.ca
- Dr. Sandeep Agrawal, Professor, Ryerson University, sagrawal@ryerson.ca
- Daniela Tuchel, Special Intern, MITACS/Metropolis BC Internship, danielatuchel@gmail.com

Advisory Committee:

- Phil Calvert, Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, Phil.Calvert@international.gc.ca
- Dr. David Fung, Chairman and CEO, ACDEG Group, dtfung@uniserve.com
- Keith Godin, Director, BC Ministry of Jobs, Tourism and Innovation, Keith.Godin@gov.bc.ca

- Dr. Dan Hiebert, Professor and Co-Director, Metropolis BC, Department of Geography, UBC, Daniel.hiebert@ubc.ca
- Dr. Jean Lock Kunz, Director, Policy Horizons Canada, jean.kunz@horizons.gc.ca

***This report is presented as received from project recipient(s). It has not been subjected to peer review or other review processes.**

***This work is used with the permission of Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada (name of copyright holder)**

***Copyright 2014 (year), Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada (name of copyright holder)**

Abstract: *Research outputs should include an abstract of 150-200 words specifying the issue under investigation, the methodology, major findings, and overall impact.

See details under each item of the Research Outputs.

***Keywords: Include up to six subject keywords separated by commas.**

Human Capital, Canada-China Relations, Policy Research, Think-tank, Partnership

Table of Contents

Project Overview..... 4

The Research Problem 4

Objectives 5

Methodology..... 5

Project Activities 6

Project Outputs..... 9

Project Outcomes 13

Overall Assessment and Recommendation 14

Project Overview

The Canada-China Human Capital Dialogue (CCHCD) was a two-year international collaborative research project between a Canadian research consortium led by the Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada (APF Canada) and Chinese think tanks including the Chinese Academy of Personnel Science (CAPS), the Center for China and Globalization (CGG), and the China Society for Research on Exchanges and Development of International Professionals (CSREDIP). The project focused on the impact of China's development model on patterns of human capital flow between China and Canada and in turn the effects of such patterns on the two countries' economic relations.

The two-year project was designed to produce innovative and practical ideas for human capital exchange between the two countries in public policy, business, and civil society. The project's Canadian team studied the nature of human-capital flows between China and Canada, as well as the two countries' current talent strategies and limitations, and the implications for Canada's policies related to human capital and bilateral relations.

The project concluded that two-way human capital flows between Canada and China would continue and intensify. Both countries need to enhance cooperation between counterparts and among stakeholders in the two countries, and should re-consider a new approach to leveraging shared talent in order to facilitate two-way flows of talent as a means of promoting economic welfare in Canada and China. A shared talent strategy will increase two-way trade and investment, as well as deepen the cooperation in all key areas of Canada-China relations.

The project used a series of conferences, seminars, and workshops as a platform for policy discussion. Five conferences/seminars/workshops were held in China and Canada, during which the Canadian and Chinese research teams shared findings on their respective countries' human capital trends, policies and practices. The knowledge sharing between the two countries' research teams helped identify key policy recommendations and best practices for each nation's respective policymakers and practitioners.

The Research Problem

The project sought to investigate the relationship between China's development model and patterns of human capital flow between Canada and China, and the effects of these patterns on Canada and China's economic relations.

China's development strategy is undergoing major changes as the nation shifts away from low-end manufacturing toward greater investment in education, science and technology and research and development. As it adjusts its economic growth model, the Chinese government has forged a National Medium and Long-term Talent Development Plan aimed at creating a highly-skilled national workforce by 2020. An important component of the Plan is the Thousands Talents Program, through which China aims to attract 2,000 professionals from overseas in the next five to ten years.

At the same time, there has been a steady growth in Canada and China's population flows. Canada's shift in immigration policy to attract highly skilled labour in conjunction with a relaxation in exit

requirements by Chinese officials to allow highly skilled Chinese to study, visit, and immigrate abroad contributed to an influx of Chinese immigrants into Canada. Subsequently, highly skilled Chinese who acquired education in Canada are now returning to China. A new “pull-push” dynamic is emerging, whereby Canada seeks to develop policies that will encourage highly skilled domestic and foreign workers and students to remain in the country, while China is increasing the number of returnees to contribute to its emerging knowledge economy. Our study was designed to look at whether China and Canada could capitalize on the opportunity for human-capital cooperation between the two countries.

Objectives

The CCHCD project had four major objectives, the first three focused on the research agenda, the fourth related to the dissemination of the research results:

- 1) To better understand the nature and impact of human capital exchange between the two countries;
- 2) To identify the key factors that contribute to the human capital shortage in both countries and the industries that drive the demand for highly skilled labour;
- 3) To develop and share policy recommendations and best practices with relevant Canadian and Chinese policymakers, practitioners and members of the business community on how to improve the management of human capital flow between the two countries. The project also hopes to initiate a discussion on the potential for a bilateral agreement between China and Canada on shared human capital; and
- 4) To facilitate collaboration and sharing of knowledge between Canadian researchers and think tanks with their Chinese counterparts and help make research by Chinese organizations and scholars available to Canadian researchers and the wider Canadian public.

Methodology

This CCHCD project adopted a comparative approach to undertake parallel policy research and related activities by Chinese and Canadian teams. The Chinese partners’ research focused on China’s human capital challenges and related policies with a strong reference to Canada. A summary report of works by Chinese partners was prepared by Chinese Academy of Personnel Science and was presented at the project’s final seminar at the 16th Metropolis Conference in Canada.¹ Policy relevance was the focus of the project. Research findings and disseminations were specifically targeted at policy research communities in both China and Canada.

¹ The seminar is reported in detail under the Project Activities of this report.

The Canadian team, led by APF Canada, worked closely with its Chinese partners and conducted project research, using the following methods:

1. **Desk research** collected and summarized existing studies on barriers to foreign qualification recognition in the Canadian labour market, and strategies used by major migrant societies to recruit an external supply of skills. The results were incorporated in various project reports.
2. **A focus group study** collected qualitative information to test the findings gleaned from the literature review and identified new issues that recent Chinese immigrants to Canada face in terms of their foreign-qualification recognition. The project conducted three focus group discussions in the Greater Vancouver region, the results of which are summarized in the policy research report.
3. **An online survey** of recent Chinese immigrants across Canada sought to analyze foreign qualification recognition barriers and its relationship with other policy issues. The key findings are summarized in the policy research reports.
4. **Commissioned studies** leveraged knowledge and expertise from other Canadian and Chinese organizations working closely with APF Canada on related topics.
5. **Data requests** were put forward to Citizenship and Immigration Canada for information on permanent and temporary immigration from China, with a breakdown by province in Canada. Analysis of the data was presented in the policy research report.

Project Activities

The CCHCD project has undertaken activities through a bilateral research partnership. All project activities fall into three categories:

- Building a research partnership between think tanks: new area of cooperation;
- Conducting joint researches on issues of common interest: focus of cooperation; and
- Stimulating policy dialogue through conference series: influence of cooperation.

Building Partnerships

On November 23, 2011 in Beijing, the Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada (APF Canada) and the Chinese Academy of Personnel Science (CAPS), the Center for China and Globalization (CGG), and the China Society for Research on Exchanges and Development of International Professionals (CSREDIP) signed a joint Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). The purpose of the MOU is specified in the document as followings:

The four parties will engage in cooperation on the principle of voluntariness, equality and mutual benefit to complement one another and share resources. They will jointly study theories and policies of human capital flow and the development of cooperation between China and Canada in a globalized world and share research and best practices, such that human capital management in the two countries and new areas of cooperation will be explored to enhance bilateral relations.

The MOU allowed the creation of a new research partnership between Canadian and Chinese think tanks, offering new avenues for cooperation between policy think tanks in the two countries. The MOU was a catalyst for researchers to embark on new areas of research focusing on human capital exchange between the two countries. There are four unique features to this project:

- 1) The current research and policy discussion does not focus enough attention on the impact of China's development model on patterns of human capital flow between China and Canada. This project looks into the effects of such patterns on Canada and China's economic relations.
- 2) The research and policy discussion on human capital flows have placed the most emphasis on the movement of people from China to Canada. This project looks at the flows between the two countries that reflect the emerging trend in the high-level human exchange between Canada and China.
- 3) The project's examination of the two-way people-to-people relations provides a different perspective to complement the existing research and policy discussion on Canada and China's trade, investment, and business relations.
- 4) The project was designed and implemented as a bilateral collaboration between think tanks of the two countries, which have strong interest in and capacity for policy analysis in the area of transnational human capital flows.

During the course of this partnership, the CCHCD project has also developed a Canadian consortium supported by both public and private sectors in Canada. In early 2012, APF Canada submitted an application to IDRC for its Canadian Partnerships Small Grants Program. The IDRC grant, approved in March 2012, allowed CCHCD to conduct research and related activities from March 1, 2012 to February 28, 2014. In the meantime, APF Canada continued seeking sponsorship opportunities from public and private organizations. Consequently, the Province of British Columbia, the RBC Foundation, and Air China (Canada) provided partial funding or in-kind support to the CCHCD project.

In addition to the financial support, the CCHCD project also developed partnerships with researchers from University of Ottawa, Ryerson University, York University, MITACS, and Canada's Metropolis Project to help with the project's research and conference/seminar planning and organizing.

Conducting Research

The Canadian and Chinese teams of the CCHCD project conducted research in line with first three of the four objectives of the project, stated on page 5.

The research focused on producing innovative and practical ideas for human capital exchange between Canada and China in public policy, business, and civil society. Please refer to the detailed description of research outcomes on page 9.

Stimulating Dialogue

The project employed a series of conferences, seminars, and workshops as the platform for policy discussion. Five events were held alternately in China and Canada during over the course of the project.

The five events include:

1. November 23, 2011, Beijing. The inaugural conference brought over 100 participants from four above-mentioned organizations of Canada and China together to discuss the human capital exchange and policy implications for both countries. At the conference, a MOU was signed by four participating organizations to form a partnership of CCHCD. The conference report is available online at: http://www.rky.org.cn/c/cn/news/2011-11/24/news_11685.html.
2. November 28, 2012, Ottawa. The 2nd Conference of CCHCD, hosted by the University of Ottawa, Canada, provided a platform for both Canadian and Chinese think tanks, senior academics, policymakers, NGOs, and business representatives to exchange preliminary findings of policy research, discuss upcoming research, and above all, identify areas of bilateral cooperation on human capital issues between the two countries. A total of 45 participants attended the conference. The Conference Proceedings is available online at: <http://www.asiapacific.ca/research-report/canada-china-human-capital-dialogue-second-conference>.
3. July 3, 2013, Beijing. The 3rd Seminar of CCHCD provided a unique opportunity for the project team to meet with the policy research community in Beijing to exchange views on policy issues in Canada-China human capital exchange. This conference reviewed research undertaken to date by both Canadian and Chinese partners. Researchers and stakeholders exchanged views on and discussed the work plan for the proposed working group, the Canada-China Task Force on Human Capital. Over 100 participants from both countries attended the seminar. The event report is available online at: http://www.rky.org.cn/c/cn/news/2013-07/12/news_14267.html.
4. October 24, 2013, Toronto. The 4th Seminar of CCHCD was hosted by the Canada-China Institute for Business & Development at Ted Rogers School of Management, Ryerson University. The seminar brought more than 55 participants from Chinese partner organizations and local Canadian organizations to discuss research outcomes of the joint Canada-China Task Force on Human Capital. The event report is available online at: http://www.rky.org.cn/c/cn/news/2013-10/29/news_14453.html.
5. March 15, 2014, Gatineau. The CCHCD organized the final workshop, "Shifting Perspectives: Talent Competition to Talent Sharing," as part of the 16th National Metropolis Conference in Gatineau, Quebec. At the workshop, the joint Canada-China Task Force on Human Capital presented preliminary results of the final policy reports. Over 30 participants attended the workshop. The description of the workshop is available online at: http://www.acs-aec.ca/pdf/events/AEC_Metropolis2014_web_V27_LR.pdf (E7 on Page 32).

In addition to these five conferences and seminars, the CCHCD also organized workshops and policy roundtables as follows:

6. April 16, 2012, Vancouver. This workshop featured Dr. Qiang Zha from York University. Dr. Zha's presentation entitled, "Canadian Universities and Global Brain Circulation: The Case of Chinese Holders of Canada Research Chair," shed light on the factors that led a group of Canadian Research Chair (CRC) holders of Chinese origin to choose to work at Canadian universities. This talk led to the publication of: "Canada's 'Thousand Talent Program': How Canada Research Chair Program Attract Chinese Academics".
7. May 16, 2012, Vancouver. This workshop featured Dr. Liu Hong, Professor and Chair of the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Dr. Liu presented "Singapore's Foreign Talent Strategy and its Challenges" introducing Singapore's experience of using foreign talent for its economic development and socio-cultural regeneration.
8. July 30, 2012, Ottawa. This policy roundtable was organized in Ottawa to bring 15 participants from various policy analysts, academics, and businesspeople together to address policy issues and implications arising from intensified human capital exchange between Canada and China. A summary report was produced.

Project Outputs

To achieve the four objectives of the project, the APF Canada and the Chinese partners have followed the original research plan and developed policy research outputs in following categories:

Published Op-Eds

- 1) **Woo, Y.P. "Canada Needs Global Talent and Companies That Can Use It."** *Vancouver Sun*, April 1, 2014. (available online at: <http://www.vancouversun.com/Opinion+Canada+needs+global+talent+companies+that/9687284/story.html>)
- 2) **DeVoretz, D. and Woo, Y.P. "Ottawa's New Citizenship Rules Are Perverse."** *Toronto Star*, February 18, 2014. (available online at: http://www.thestar.com/opinion/commentary/2014/02/18/ottawas_new_citizenship_rules_are_perverse.html)
- 3) **Woo, Y.P. "Responding to Questions on Canadians Abroad in Hong Kong."** *President's View*, June 10, 2013, Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada, Vancouver. (Available online at: <http://www.asiapacific.ca/editorials/presidents-view/39336>)
- 4) **Zhang, K. "Untapped: Canada's Human Capital in China,"** *Canada China Business Forum*, November 2013, Page 43-44 (English) and Page 45-47 (French), Canada China Business Council,

Toronto. (Available online at: <http://www.ccbc.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/Canada-China-Business-Forum-Magazine-20131.pdf>)

Published Research Papers

- 5) **Zhang, K. "Flows of People and the Canada–China Relationship in the 21st Century,"** Chapter 3 in Zhang, J. and Duncan, H. (eds.) (2014), *Migration in China and Asia*, Springer.
<http://www.springer.com/social+sciences/population+studies/book/978-94-017-8758-1>
This paper provides an overview of the multi-stream flows of people between China and Canada and illustrates how Chinese communities in Canada have been reshaped as a result. At the same time, the paper discusses the growing Canadian diaspora in China. Looking through the lens of the human capital exchange, this study examines some of the key policy implications of this migration in the shaping of Canada-China relations in this century.
- 6) **Zhang, K. et al., "The Quest for Foreign Skills–International Recruitment Strategies in the Asia-Pacific Region,"** Chapter 10 in Dobson, W. (eds.) (2013), *Human Capital Formation and Economic Growth in Asia and the Pacific*, Routledge, New York.
<http://www.routledge.com/books/details/9780415838832/>
This paper examines immigration and recruitment strategies of Australia, Canada, Hong Kong SAR, Japan, Singapore, and the United States. Many countries depend on immigrant labor forces to offset the impact of aging populations, to obtain new knowledge and foreign talent, to promote entrepreneurship, and to expand into foreign markets. The paper discusses how governments are responding to mounting competition for highly skilled workers, and the determinants and consequences of these recruitment programs, both for receiving and sending countries.
- 7) **Zhang, K. "Recognizing Qualifications Made-in-China: Barriers and Recommendations,"** *Fortune World Magazine*, January 2014, Vol. 10, Page 78-83 (in Chinese and English), Vancouver. This paper identifies the barriers to recognizing foreign qualifications of skilled immigrants from China to Canada. It also offers a series of recommendations for policy makers and practitioners to consider how Canada can overcome these barriers.

Commissioned Research Reports

- 8) **Zha, Q. "Canada's Thousand Talent Program: How Canada Research Chair Program Attracts Chinese Academics,"** *Research Reports*, October 24, 2013, Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada, Vancouver. (Available online at: <http://www.asiapacific.ca/research-report/canadas-thousand-talent-program-how-canada-research-chair-pr>)
This report explores the factors that influenced a group of Canada Research Chair holders from China to choose to work in Canadian universities. The research sheds light on the forces that impact global flows of talent and knowledge. The findings suggest that Canadian universities are attractive to Chinese scholars due to a combination of Canada's prevailing collectivist and multicultural ideologies and their integration into academia.

- 9) **Wang, H. "China's Competition for Global Talents: Strategy, Policy and Recommendations"** *Research Reports*, May 24, 2012, Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada, Vancouver. (available at <http://www.asiapacific.ca/sites/default/files/filefield/researchreportv7.pdf>)

This research report examines where China currently stands in the global competition for talent and outlines measures for China to attract top talent from abroad. This piece highlights how the global competition for talent is intensifying and argues China needs to move quickly to improve its measures to cultivate and attract greater human capital.

- 10) **Agrawal, S. "Chinese Immigrants to Canada and Their Labour Market Performance,"** presented at the 3rd Seminar of CCHCD, July 3, 2013, Beijing.

This research paper develops a brief socio-economic profile of the Chinese-Canadian community, the second-largest immigrant group in Canada. It also assesses Chinese immigrants' labour market performance relative to those of immigrants from the Philippines and South Asia, using customized tables from Statistics Canada's Longitudinal Administrative Database. The results show that Chinese immigrants in Canada fall under two broad categories: those who have achieved upward economic mobility with time in Canada; and, those who have not experienced much upward mobility, even after residing in the country for many years. The results also show that among high-income earners, Chinese immigrants outperform many other contemporary immigrant groups. Relative to Indian immigrants in particular, Chinese appears to have benefitted from the rising economy in their home country as well as a strong ethnic economy they have created within Canada.

- 11) **Wang, H. "The Role of NGOs in Talent Exchange between China and Canada,"** presentation to the 3rd Seminar of CCHCD, July 3, 2013, Beijing.

This research report profiles various NGOs in Canada and China to analyze their role in talent exchange between the two countries. Based on a survey, the report finds the NGOs affect talent exchange between China and Canada in the following ways:

They help to establish contact between two countries and become a medium for talent exchange (100%); organize talent exchange directly to be a talent exchange platform (89%); contribute to international projects cooperation and promoting talent exchanges and cooperation (78%); become an overseas talent information database, servicing for government overseas talent development (67%); and become an information platform to help talented individuals learn about their home country, which helps to drive talent returning home (33%). The report further proposes policy suggestions for strengthening the impact of NGOs on talent exchange.

Planned Research Reports

- 12) **Toward a Canada-China Shared Talent Strategy**

This final research report summarizes major research findings and policy recommendations from

the Canadian team of this CCHCD project. It is being edited and finalized while this technical report is being prepared. The final research report is estimated to be released in summer 2014.

13) Comparative Study of Talent Introduction Policies between Canada and China

This final research report summarizes major research findings and policy recommendations from the Chinese team of this project. It is being edited and finalized while this technical report is being prepared. The final research report is estimated to be released in summer 2014.

14) Future Publications

Further dissemination of the project outcomes, including a possible joint publication and other policy briefings, is being discussed with Chinese partners. However, there is no conclusion yet on the timeline and related details.

In addition to policy-focused researches, the CCHCD project has also developed outputs in line with the capacity-building as highlighted below:

- 15) June 2011: A project website was developed as a platform to exchange and share research findings and policy discussions. The website is <http://www.asiapacific.ca/canada-china-human-capital>, which provides summary of major project research and activities. It includes a link to the Chinese site that is managed by Chinese partners.
- 16) May 17, 2012: A presentation on “Multi-stream Flows Reshape Chinese Communities in Canada: A Human Capital Perspective” was delivered at the 5th International Conference of Institutes and Libraries for Chinese Overseas Studies on Chinese through the Americas at the UBC (available online at <https://circle.ubc.ca/handle/2429/43437>).
- 17) June 14-17, 2012: Yuen Pau Woo, President and CEO of APF Canada, spoke on the importance of two-way flows of human capital, with special emphasis on the Canada-China relationship at the 2nd China Innovation and Entrepreneurial Talent Development Conference, in Shenzhen. It was attended by Li Yuanchao, then head of the CPC’s Organization Department and the senior leader responsible for China’s “Thousand Talents” program, and now the Vice President of China.
- 18) May 9, 2014: A presentation on “Leveraging Shared Talent—The Future of Canadian-Chinese Cooperation” was delivered at the Conference on Transforming Canada-China Educational Cooperation: Significant Legacies and Future Challenges at Tsinghua University, Beijing. (Details of the conference are available online at: http://www.oise.utoronto.ca/cidec/Research/conference_2014.html)
- 19) June 30, 2013: Yuen Pau Woo, President and CEO of APF Canada, was appointed to the China Global Talents Society’s international consultant team. (Details of the China Global Talents Society are available here: http://scgti.org/citc/en/about_us.html)

- 20) Three groups of Chinese delegation, consisting of 41 officials and researchers from Chinese partners, visited Canada during the course of the project. Among these visits, two groups of 36 delegates stayed in Canada for 2-3 weeks respectively on a study tour to learn about human capital policy and practice in Canada.
- 21) Canadian delegates made 29 visits for the project-related conferences and activities in China. This Canadian participation provided an excellent opportunity for the sharing of knowledge and experience between Canadian and Chinese officials, researchers, and practitioners. It also served to make the Canadian experience on human capital policy and practice more visible and accessible to Chinese policy makers and researchers.
- 22) Two Canadian speakers were recommended by APF Canada to Chinese partners as keynote speakers at high-level policy conferences on human capital and talent-attraction policy in China. Both Canadian speakers came from federal government policy departments and spoke Canadian experience at the conferences. Their participations were highly recognized by conference organizers.
- 23) Media reports often quoted researchers of the project on stories related to the Canada China human capital exchange topics. These media stories appeared in both English-language media and Chinese-language publications in Canada and China.

Project Outcomes

The CCHCD project seeks to have an impact on policy research and policymaking in both countries. The outcomes of this project can be summarized as follows:

- 1) Raising awareness of China's development model on patterns of human capital flow between Canada and China and its impact on bilateral relations. In other words, China is no longer sending its workers overseas, but is now also receiving workers from outside China.
- 2) Identifying key factors that contribute to the human capital flow between the two countries, including governmental policies and programs, educational institutions, professional organizations and other NGOs, employers, and mobile individuals.
- 3) Identifying policy challenges emerging from the high-level human capital exchange between the two countries, rather than focusing on one-way movement of people from China to Canada.
- 4) Proposing a new strategy on shared talent between the two countries to enhance the people-to-people relations through two-way flow of human capital and to enrich current policy discussions on Canada and China's trade, investment, and business relations.
- 5) Generating more interest from Chinese policy researchers on Canada. The Chinese partner think tanks have sent delegates to Canada to meet their counterparts. They now include Canada in

their policy research projects, and invite Canadian experts through APF Canada to be involved in their research and to their high-level policy conferences.

Nevertheless, some problems arose during the project implementation.

1) Adjustment of Original Designed Objective

The original second objective of the project—“To identify the key factors that contribute to the human capital shortage in both countries and the industries that drive the demand for highly skilled labour.”—was changed to “To identify the key factors that contribute to the human capital flow between the two countries.”

The project team made this adjustment after it realized that governmental policies and programs in both countries had included the consideration of human capital shortage and industrial demand for highly skilled labour. To avoid redundancy, the project team decided to focus on policy analysis without changing the overall direction of the project. Other objectives remained as originally designed.

2) Unexpected Delays

The project had to postpone planned conferences and seminars due to longer-than-expected preparation of travel documents to Canada. Research progress was also delayed by the postponement of data requests from original information sources. These delays did not have any impact on the final deliverables and budget of the project. However, it delayed the timeline of the project in two ways. It caused a delay for the overall process as originally scheduled, and it left shorter time to prepare for the next activities. APF Canada has been coordinating carefully with Chinese partners to minimize the impact incurred from these delays.

3) Difference in Deliverable Timelines

In addition to the grant from IDRC, this project has received financial support from the Government of Canada, the province of British Columbia, and the RBC Foundation. Each funding agency has different timeline of supporting the various activities of the project. APF Canada has to prioritize the work specified in each contract as well as to move forward the overall project according to the original timeline.

4) Difference in Research Style

There were some differences in research style between Chinese and Canadian think tanks. The Chinese researchers are more familiar with writing scholarly papers for academic publications, while Canadian researchers are more interested in producing policy-relevant reports. Over time, the two sides have learned from each other and come to a consensus in preparing the final research outcomes.

Overall Assessment and Recommendation

During the project period, the CCHCD has made significant accomplishments in achieving the project’s objectives in the following ways:

- 1) It has built a strong partnership between think tanks of both countries, allowing policy research collaborations to investigate issues of human capital exchange, which are of interest to both sides. The project generated strong research interests from its Chinese partner organizations, which injected substantial financial and human resources to form a Chinese team to participate in the project. Because of this, research outcomes are also more likely to have a direct impact on policy considerations in both countries.
- 2) In Canada, the project has successfully developed into a consortium supported by both public and private donors, with participation from policy researchers from various universities and organizations. The CCHCD project team is extremely grateful to IDRC, the Province of British Columbia, the RBC Foundation, and Air China (Canada) for their financial or in-kind support to the project. The project team also thankfully acknowledges intellectual participation and support from University of Ottawa, Ryerson University, York University, MITACS, and Canada's Metropolis Project.
- 3) The project's research has resulted in key recommendations for human capital exchange between the two countries in public policy, business, and civil society.
- 4) The project team frequently contributed op-eds and research papers to engage directly in Canada's public discussion on policy topics related to the research filed of the project.
- 5) The team's use of a series of conferences as a platform for policy discussion turned out to be an effective means of stimulating dialogue between and among policy officials and researchers from both countries. Having team members speak and present papers at policy, academic, and business conferences extended engagement with a broader audience that is interested in the project topics.

Overall, the enormous investment of time, effort, and funding toward this project has received fruitful rewards. The project built and managed a strong partnership with Chinese policy think tanks related to human capital management, developed new knowledge in areas of human capital exchange between Canada and China, and stimulated policy dialogues by organizing conferences and events targeted at relevant audiences. Finally, the project offered a policy recommendation for both countries to reconsider a new approach to leveraging shared talent.

Looking toward the future, the Chinese side expressed strong interest in developing this established partnership and is prepared to provide their own resources to continue collaborative research on newly selected and policy issues of common interest. However, due to the ending of the funding from the Canadian donors, the partnership faces a dilemma. Therefore, a final recommendation is that IDRC should consider supporting the project through funding in order to continue leveraging the outcomes of this established partnership through this CCHCD project.